

自 Idealliance 跟 APTEC 於 2018 年 9 月 20 日終止 Idealliance China 合約後，引來了業界很大的迴響和揣測，甚至有錯誤的報導。

台灣中華印刷科技學會於 2018 年 10 月 19 日曾在其網上及其雜誌刊登了文章「台灣印刷業界，男兒當自強」

[http://cagst.org.tw/addlist\\_c.php?tb=YWRkbGlzdF8yMDEzMDEyMTEzMTkzOQ==&no=50](http://cagst.org.tw/addlist_c.php?tb=YWRkbGlzdF8yMDEzMDEyMTEzMTkzOQ==&no=50)

，當中內容有錯誤，經本中心於 10 月 22 日發出聲明後，學會將之下架，卻於 2018 年 11 月 2 日再次放在網上，部份內容雖有修改，但仍然不盡不實。

作為公眾的組織，誠信和公信力是非常重要的，因此印刷科技研究中心 (APTEC) 管理委員會一致決定將美國 Idealliance 之前所發之電郵原文向業界公開，讓業界清楚了解事件的來龍去脈和真相。

有關中華印刷科技學會刊登之文章「台灣印刷業界，男兒當自強」其中有誤之部份原文：

2018 年 10 月 19 日之版本	2018 年 11 月 2 日修改，並重新再放上網
<p>但我們擔心的問題是 APTEC 發出的緊急通知書內容，隱約提到 Idealliance Taiwan 的成立是造成此事件的關鍵原因，但這絕對是個誤導，希望不要因為此事而破壞兩岸四地的長期關係。</p>	<p>將原文黃色的部份修改成：但這很容易造成誤導</p> <p>(其實是誰做成誤導?)</p>
<p>但台灣的印刷業確實感受到彭安琪女士為了維持 APTEC 在大中華地區 G7 獨家代理的關係，卻把政治議題帶進印刷認證推廣談判，這是讓台灣印刷業者沒法接受的，當然也很容易傷害到兩岸四地印刷業者過去那麼緊密的交流與交情。</p>	<p>本中心已在 10 月 22 日作出澄清，文章已經刪除原文黃色的部份。</p>
<p>而在 1990 年以後 10 年，台港的印刷業者往來也慢慢擴大到兩岸四地，這份情誼如果因為小生意代理關係而以政治議題來介入，那就太令人覺得惋惜了。</p>	<p>刪除了原文黃色的部份</p>

同時以下是 APTEC 及 Idealliance 之間的事件簿，以及相關之電郵來往內容，讓大家了解十年來 Idealliance 與 APTEC 均是合作愉快，卻在幾個月時內演變至解除合約，以及後期 Idealliance 甚至更針對個人行為。

2017 年 2018 年	APTEC 成為 Idealliance China 已經十年，Idealliance 對 APTEC 多年來的表現表示讚賞和認同，包括前 CEO Mr. David Steinhardt 及現任 CEO Mr. Timothy Baechle，一直均合作愉快，而且 APTEC 向行業一直積極推動 Idealliance 的技術。	<a href="#">P. 4 - 5</a>
2018 年 6 月 9 日	APTEC 收到 Tim 傳來的電郵通知經 Idealliance 方面思量「決定」成立 Idealliance Taiwan，根據 APTEC 與 Idealliance 簽定之合約，台灣是 Idealliance China 之覆蓋地區，加上鑑於 Tim 對台灣之描述，APTEC 提出強烈反對之回覆，並提醒 Tim 此舉可能所觸發之問題，此回覆是經過 APTEC 管理層商討之一致結果。同時於 7 月 11 日，Idealliance 發出新聞稿宣佈 Tim Baechle 成為新一任 CEO。	<a href="#">P. 6 - 8</a>
2018 年 6 月 12 日	Idealliance 撤回成立 Idealliance Taiwan 之決定。	<a href="#">P. 8</a>
2018 年 9 月 2 日	Idealliance 再次提及成立 Idealliance Taiwan。	<a href="#">P. 8 - 9</a>
2018 年 9 月 3 日	Idealliance 再次傳電郵提及將會成立 Idealliance Taiwan，Idealliance 更說明一些對 APTEC 的指控，APTEC 反對其指控，並作出相關之回應和解釋。	<a href="#">P. 9 - 11</a>
2018 年 9 月 13 日	Idealliance 明確說明 Idealliance Taiwan 「已經」成立，但沒有說明如何處理合約問題，並「突然」指控 Brenda（即是彭安琪）的個人行為，但由於沒有明確解釋其個人行為有何問題，Brenda 本人更不明白其指控，她要求說明清楚，但最後 Tim 沒有解釋。	<a href="#">P. 12 - 13</a>
2018 年 9 月 19 日	由於 Brenda 一直與 APTEC 管理委員會密切報告有關 Idealliance 之事，因此管理委員會主席何家鏗先生向 Idealliance 董事局主席發信要求解釋，特別是 Idealliance 如何處理現時的合約，因為合約列明 Idealliance China 是包括台灣。	<a href="#">P. 13 - 14</a>

<p>2018年9月20日</p>	<p>APTEC 何家鏗主席尚未收到 Idealliance 主席之回覆，APTEC 卻已經收到 Idealliance 一個簡單的終止合約電郵通知，但沒有提及交接等問題。</p> <p>同日稍後，Brenda 收到 Idealliance 董事局主席回覆所有委員（由於當時 Brenda 是 Idealliance 董事局成員之一，因此收到此電郵），主席 Wayne 表明董事局不處理，因此不會回覆何家鏗先生。</p>	<p><a href="#">P. 14 - 16</a></p>
<p>2018年10月7日</p>	<p>由於 APTEC 主席沒有收到 Idealliance 主席之前的回覆，因此再向 Idealliance 發出電郵跟進，並要求澄清事件以及有權追討賠償。</p>	<p><a href="#">P. 16 - 17</a></p>
<p>2018年10月8日至15日期間</p>	<p>APTEC 主席又沒有收到回覆，取而代之是由 Idealliance CEO Tim 回覆，並展開多個電郵對話。</p> <p>多個郵件內 Tim 沒有提及 Idealliance 違反與 APTEC 合約之問題，反而大部份篇幅均著重針對 Brenda 個人行為，以及轉為 APTEC 違規（之前沒有提及過）。</p> <p>而當中 APTEC 主席多次要求證據，Tim 卻沒有提供，只是提供兩位人士以及兩個供應商，經 APTEC 董事向他們求證，沒有發現 APTEC 違規之證據。</p>	<p><a href="#">P. 18 - 25</a></p>
<p>2018年11月29日</p>	<p>APTEC 主席再向 Tim 發電郵回應，說明並沒有發現 APTEC 違規之證據，以及眾委員全力支持 Brenda 及肯定其工作和貢獻，並要求 Tim 撤回其指控及向 Brenda 道歉。</p>	<p><a href="#">P. 25 - 26</a></p>

**2017 年至 2018 年 – Idealliance 對 APTEC 的讚賞**

- APTEC 成為 Idealliance China 已經十年，以下對話是 Idealliance 對 APTEC 多年來的表現表示讚賞和認同，包括前 CEO Mr. David Steinhardt 及現任 CEO Mr. Timothy Baechle，一直均合作愉快，而且 APTEC 向行業一直積極推動 Idealliance 的技術。

**From:** Timothy Baechle [mailto:tbaechle@idealliance.org]

**Sent:** Friday, November 3, 2017 9:54 AM

**To:** Brenda; David Steinhardt

**Subject:** Re: 10-year collaboration!

Brenda—

That is a tremendous milestone and we too treasure our partnership. APTEC is a shining example of success and innovative leadership. Our relationship truly means the world to us, because our collaboration is changing the world in which we serve. Thank you and your staff for all that you do.

Best,

Timothy Baechle

Vice President , Global Print Technologies & Workflows

---

**From:** David Steinhardt [mailto:dsteinhardt@idealliance.org]

**Sent:** Friday, November 3, 2017 9:53 PM

**To:** Brenda

**Cc:** Timothy Baechle; David Steinhardt

**Subject:** RE: 10-year collaboration!

Dear Brenda,

10 years! How did the time fly by so quickly? I remember when we first met and started working together. We are older and wiser now!

And most certainly we will have another 10 years. Let's say 15 years...and the 25<sup>th</sup> Anniversary in 2032!

You and your organization and team are an incredible partner. I know Tim in his travels to see you in the coming week will emphasize our partnership. That partnership has helped our two organizations become a global player. Your insights, leadership, and steadfastness is central to making it all happen. THANK YOU!

During the upcoming Board meeting and when you are back in the US we will celebrate! We would like to recognize APTEC and you!

Again, thank you. To another 5...10...15 years!

Best Always,

David J. Steinhardt  
President & CEO  
Idealliance

---

(抽取部份相關之原文)

寄件人: Timothy Baechle <[tbaechle@idealliance.org](mailto:tbaechle@idealliance.org)>  
日期: 2017 年 12 月 21 日 下午 11:29:05 [GMT+8]  
收件人: Brenda Pang <[brendaok@aptec.hkprinters.org](mailto:brendaok@aptec.hkprinters.org)>  
標題: RE: Idealliance Asia

Hi Brenda—

You are one of the most committed, intelligent, trustworthy, honest, and driven people I have ever met in my life. The reason I approached this idea with you when I was in China was because of the quality of your character and how you run your business. I wish I could clone you.

---

**From:** Timothy Baechle [mailto:[tbaechle@idealliance.org](mailto:tbaechle@idealliance.org)]  
**Sent:** Wednesday, May 9, 2018 9:48 PM  
**To:** Brenda  
**Subject:** RE: Invoice for July 2017 through November 2017 Idealliance China projects

You are an incredible partner. You are so honest and trustworthy and this is the foundation for everything in life. I am so glad we get to work together.

Best,  
**Timothy Baechle**  
Vice President

---

## 2018年6月 – Idealliance 決定設立 Idealliance Taiwan

- 於6月9日，APTEC收到Tim傳來的電郵通知經Idealliance方面思量「決定」成立Idealliance Taiwan
- 根據APTEC與Idealliance簽定之合約，台灣是Idealliance China之覆蓋地區，加上鑑於Idealliance對台灣之描述，APTEC提出強烈反對之回覆，並提醒Tim此舉可能所觸發之問題，此回覆是經過APTEC管理層商討之一致結果
- 於7月11日，Idealliance發出新聞稿宣佈Tim Baechle成為新一任CEO

(抽取部份相關之原文)

**From:** Timothy Baechle [mailto:tbaechle@idealliance.org]

**Sent:** Saturday, June 9, 2018 1:03 AM

**To:** Brenda

**Subject:** (2) Items, Which Includes One Change

Hi Brenda—

I hope this finds you well. I wanted to catch up with you about a couple of items. The first item is, we have made a decision to open Idealliance Taiwan, due to the growing demand of programs there. We realize this is a sensitive territory of China, which is the same for Taiwan, however, they do not feel part of China and do not want to join or partake in China, but have a tremendous need for what we do not only in training, but teaching our curriculum in this country. We recognize Taiwan as Taiwan, a country of 28 million+ people that is growing and they want and need what we produce and we absolutely need to continuously serve the world. I would be more than happy to discuss this with you via Skype regarding our decision.

Best,

**Timothy Baechle**

Vice President

(抽取部份相關之原文)

**From:** [brendaok@aptec.hkprinters.org](mailto:brendaok@aptec.hkprinters.org) <[brendaok@aptec.hkprinters.org](mailto:brendaok@aptec.hkprinters.org)>

**Sent:** Saturday, June 09, 2018 6:14 AM

**To:** Timothy Baechle <[tbaechle@idealliance.org](mailto:tbaechle@idealliance.org)>

**Subject:** Re: (2) Items, Which Includes One Change

Hi Tim

Very shocked with your email! Idealliance China's territory includes Taiwan since we established 10 years ago! You now suddenly told me that you made the decision to separate, but not discussed

with me before. It includes in our agreement.

In addition, you touch a very sensitive political issue of China. I am not sure how the impact and our association's response are. You may offend China. Be careful!

---

(抽取部份相關之原文)

**From:** Timothy Baechle [mailto:tbaechle@idealliance.org]

**Sent:** Saturday, June 9, 2018 8:25 PM

**To:** brendaok@aptec.hkprinters.org

**Subject:** RE: (2) Items, Which Includes One Change

Hi Brenda—

I did not imagine my email would be well received. This is something that we took over (6) months to do a needs analysis, market analysis and also a perception analysis. We knew it was sensitive. This is why I have been deeply encouraging you to explore areas outside of the traditional areas you typically cover-Hong Kong and Shanghai because there were many things unfolding right around you that were left underserved. You guys do an incredible job. Absolutely top partners of Idealliance and we have great appreciate, admiration, affection and trust in Idealliance China, however Taiwan is a territory that is unique because of their position. .... Many organizations have co-located offices in Taiwan and Mainland China, etc. It simply cannot be treated as an isolated country. We completely understand the political history of Taiwan from every country that staked rights to it. We are not stating it does not belong to China, we are simply setting up to serve and underserved region.

---

**From:** Brenda <[brendaok@aptec.hkprinters.org](mailto:brendaok@aptec.hkprinters.org)>

**Sent:** Monday, June 11, 2018 9:25 PM

**To:** Timothy Baechle <[tbaechle@idealliance.org](mailto:tbaechle@idealliance.org)>

**Subject:** RE: (2) Items, Which Includes One Change

Hi Tim,

I feel very frustrated and unhappy for your action. As your long-term partner, you have not discussed with me, especially Taiwan is our covered region. However, even you have studied for 6 months, you didn't talk to me anymore. I feel that we are not being respected and we don't think that it is the basis of a long-established partnership. Your brother is very angry, too.

I need to tell you seriously. You are touching the most sensitive political issue of China. You action

violates One China Policy which is honoured by Trump. If you insist to setup Idealliance Taiwan, you have to take the risk to totally lose China market as we can foresee China will not use even ban Idealliance's initiatives. And I have to resign Idealliance's board member as I and our Association cannot accept this decision.

In addition, according to our agreement since 2007, the region covered includes Taiwan. We spent a lot of time and resources in development. We can entitle for compensation. Your decision means the breach of contract.

Regards,  
Brenda Pang

---

2018 年 6 月 12 日 – Idealliance 撤回成立 Idealliance Taiwan 之決定

**From:** Timothy Baechle [mailto:tbaechle@idealliance.org]

**Sent:** Tuesday, June 12, 2018 10:48 AM

**To:** Brenda

**Subject:** RE: (2) Items, Which Includes One Change

Hi Brenda—

Ok, we will not move forward in Taiwan. Our relationship and partnership with you, Lewis, and Idealliance China means far too much.

Best,

**Timothy Baechle**

Vice President

---

2018 年 9 月 2 日 – Idealliance 再次提及成立 Idealliance Taiwan

- Idealliance 又突然轉方向？

**From:** Timothy Baechle [mailto:tbaechle@idealliance.org]

**Sent:** Sunday, September 2, 2018 11:45 PM

**To:** Brenda

**Subject:** Changes to Be Occurring

Brenda—



Following up on many months of concern which I have been outlining to you in writing, including the most recent events that have come to light this past week which I outlined to you in writing, also some additional information we received from quite a number of Chinese business partners, it is has come to the point where we must make a decision. Over the past 10+ years, you have failed to cover the region assigned to you, in particular Taiwan, which has resulted in this particular country not being served. A country of over 8000+ printers. Furthermore, this country does not want APTEC serving them, which has also come to light. As a result, Idealliance HQ, will be setting up Idealliance Taiwan to serve this region. You can maintain your remaining region, however, I will tell you, as I have explained many times, you are missing the entire country of China because your entire focus is on Hong Kong, Shanghai (occasionally) and Guangdong (occasionally). China is a country of over 60,000+ print service providers and countless brands-a region that is greatly migrating to digital printing with a great presence of many other technologies beyond offset and a great need for Idealliance programs, including G7® for many other print technologies, training for OEMs, suppliers and especially BrandQ® training in the region. If you look at how OEMs set-up the region, they typically divide China up as: China North, China Central, China South (which includes Hong Kong) and Taiwan is completely separate on its own, as its own country. These are large OEMs and you are a small organization. Idealliance is focused on serving everyone, no matter where they are in the world. Idealliance is growing and we have strong interest in China from others as well to serve. As I stated in my email last week, we need to get our relationship on much better footing and we need focus, rather than the dissent that is coming from Idealliance China. If this is not possible, we will be forced to make further decisions.

Best,

**Timothy Baechle**

CEO

---

**2018 年 9 月 3 日 – Idealliance 更向 APTEC 提出指責**

- 於 2018 年 9 月 3 日，Idealliance 再次傳電郵提及將會成立 Idealliance Taiwan
- Idealliance 更說明一些對 APTEC 的指控，APTEC 反對其指控，並作出相關之回應和解釋

**From:** Timothy Baechle [mailto:tbaechle@idealliance.org]

**Sent:** Monday, September 3, 2018 10:09 PM

**To:** Brenda

**Subject:** (2) Points of Breach of MOU Agreement

Brenda—

As we have been discussing in emails over recent weeks and months, your actions have violated (2)

points of the executed MOU between APTEC and Idealliance HQ.

1. You are not authorized to assign a market, programs, contracts, pricing, trademarks, or our intellectual property, etc...to any 3<sup>rd</sup> Party entity. The MOU is governed by Idealliance HQ and your extension of a contract to PTRI is in violation of this agreement.
2. As outlined in the MOU, failure to cover the region assigned can result in termination, corrective action or non-renewal. I have outlined my issues regarding coverage for many months now only to be met with dissent and threats from you, very serious threats, which is conduct unbecoming of a partner. For the past 10+ years, you have failed to cover much of your territory, especially Taiwan, you even included your reference of non-coverage to this region in an email dated 8/30/2018.

Best,

**Timothy Baechle**

CEO

---

**From:** Brenda <[brendaok@aptec.hkprinters.org](mailto:brendaok@aptec.hkprinters.org)>  
**Sent:** Thursday, September 13, 2018 2:48 AM  
**To:** Timothy Baechle <[tbaechle@idealliance.org](mailto:tbaechle@idealliance.org)>  
**Subject:** RE: (2) Points of Breach of MOU Agreement

Hi Tim,

Regarding your email below, please find our response as below:

1. You are not authorized to assign a market, programs, contracts, pricing, trademarks, or our intellectual property, etc...to any 3<sup>rd</sup> Party entity. The MOU is governed by Idealliance HQ and your extension of a contract to PTRI is in violation of this agreement.

As per my email to you dated Aug 30, 2018, we did not authorize the above-mentioned items to any 3rd Party entity. As a long term partner, we have been collaborating successfully with Idealliance HQ in the last 10 years. We respect the MOU and did not violate the agreement to extend a contract to PTRI. It will be helpful for us to investigate if we will be shared with the full details of those false information that led to your understanding of above.

2. As outlined in the MOU, failure to cover the region assigned can result in termination, corrective action or non-renewal. I have outlined my issues regarding coverage for many months now only to be met with dissent and threats from you, very serious threats, which is conduct unbecoming of a partner. For the past 10+ years, you have failed to cover much

of your territory, especially Taiwan, you even included your reference of non-coverage to this region in an email dated 8/30/2018.

As you said before, we did an incredible job. Absolutely top partners of Idealliance and we have great appreciate, admiration, affection and trust in Idealliance China and our efforts in promoting and supporting Idealliance in our region is well recognized. We have trained, educated and served a lot of printing professionals from various cities of China including Taiwan through different kinds of training programmes, summits, conferences, seminars, workshops, testing projects, articles, etc. And we are evaluating the G7 Master press forms from the whole Greater China, and providing technical support. Working in line with Idealliance, we strive to help the printing industry in our region to appreciate, experience and embrace Idealliance programmes. We always discuss with you our plans especially those to address your concerns of coverage, such as the activities in Taiwan just finished which I mentioned to you on Jun 9 and Aug 24, 2018, and exploring more expert trainings in 2019 which I mentioned on Jun 21, 2018. Again, it will be helpful if we will discuss more on the details of events and coverage in our region, and be shared with the situations in other regions for reference. I am open to explore more development in future.

Being a long-term partner of Idealliance, we care about the interest of Idealliance. It is our responsibility to raise our concerns as per my email dated Jun 12, 2018 to you on setting up the idealliance Taiwan.

We treasure a lot our partnership with Idealliance and the achievement we have made together. We look forward to continuous collaboration with Idealliance to support the printing industry in our region.

Thank you for your kind attention.

Regards,  
Brenda Pang  
Executive Director

---

Advanced Printing Technology Centre  
(A subsidiary of The Hong Kong Printers Association)  
Idealliance China (Exclusive Partner of Idealliance in Greater China)  
Adobe Authorised Training Centre  
Web: [www.aptec.hkprinters.org](http://www.aptec.hkprinters.org) / [www.idealliance-china.org](http://www.idealliance-china.org)  
Tel: 852-3589-5021  
Fax: 852-3188-9424

---

2018年9月13日 – Idealliance 提及 Idealliance Taiwan 已經成立，  
並「突然」指控 Brenda 個人行為

- Idealliance 明確說明 Idealliance Taiwan 已經成立，但沒有說明如何處理合約問題
- 並「突然」指控 Brenda 的個人行為，但由於沒有明確解釋其個人行為有何問題，Brenda 本人更不明白其指控，她要求說明清楚，但最後沒有解釋。
- 但 Idealliance 一直沒有提及違反合約的問題

Timothy Baechle <[tbaechle@idealliance.org](mailto:tbaechle@idealliance.org)> 於 2018年9月13日 下午 9:56 寫道：

Brenda—

The concerns continue to mount, as more information continues to come to light. I would say our relationship is on the most unstable ground it has ever been. Idealliance Taiwan has been set up, which is no longer your coverage area, but falls under Fred Hsu. To say I am disappointed by the things I have heard and that have come to light is an enormous understatement. Your actions have effected many and I am terribly saddened by what I have learned and especially your actions on a personal level.

**Timothy Baechle**

CEO

Idealliance

---

Brenda Pang <[brendaok@aptec.hkprinters.org](mailto:brendaok@aptec.hkprinters.org)> 於 2018年9月16日 下午 8:53 寫道：

Tim,

I don't know what you heard which makes me unable to respond. It took a lot of effort to build a 10-year partnership in which trust is very important. However, you only believe in what you have heard or found about us without trying to verify with me. Although I explained to you and requested for more details to clarify in previous emails, you still have very negative opinions to us. We always support Idealliance's initiatives in all-rounded. But your accusations without evidence makes me uncomfortable, confused and unable to clarify.

We have built very deep relationship with Idealliance and I am always transparent to you and to my board members. As said before, I am open to discuss the future development. So please tell me what we should do for the benefit of Idealliance in this region.

Brenda

Sent by my iPhone

---

**From:** "Timothy Baechle" <tbaechle@idealliance.org>

**To:** "Brenda Pang" <brendaok@aptec.hkprinters.org>

**Sent:** Mon, 17 Sep 2018 16:41:40 +0000

**Subject:** Re: (2) Points of Breach of MOU Agreement

Brenda—

- 1) Idealliance Taiwan has already been established and I notified you of this in writing.
- 2) Idealliance holds the MOU and as I have outlined for many months, in writing, you failed to act in accordance with with MOU (you personally). Among many other actions unbecoming of an Idealliance partner. Again, these all have to do with your personal actions and none of your staff. Therefore, you did not correct your actions, so we took action.
- 3) Idealliance Taiwan can determine on their own how they will process G7 Master submissions.
- 4) Idealliance Taiwan is an independent office from that of yours and you have no governance or oversight over them.

Timothy Baechle

CEO

---

**2018 年 9 月 19 日- APTEC 主席發電郵予 Idealliance 董事局**

- 由於 Brenda 一直與 APTEC 管理委員會密切報告有關 Idealliance 之事，因此管理委員會主席何家鏗先生決定向 Idealliance 董事局主席發信要求解釋以下四點：
- Brenda 如何不按照合約辦事？
  - 什麼行為引致不能成為 Idealliance 的合作伙伴？
  - 有關成立 Idealliance Taiwan 之事宜，有沒有在董事局會議討論過？
  - Idealliance 如何處理現時的合約？因為合約列明 Idealliance China 是包括台灣。

From: chairman@aptec.hkprinters.org

Sent: Wednesday, September 19, 2018 10:00am

To: Wayne@FlatOutBranding.com

Cc: tllucien@aarp.org, dpagliarello@kmb.konicaminolta.us, JSola@zinio.com,

dick.ryan@lsc.com, tbaechle@idealliance.org, dsteinhardt@idealliance.org,

Michael.Grady@sgsco.com, ejansen@csa.canon.com, todd@cbx.com,

brendaok@aptec.hkprinters.org, steven@harwillexpresspress.com, Frank.Tueckmantel@efi.com

Subject: Partnership between Idealliance and APTEC / Idealliance China

Dear Mr. Marshall,

### **Partnership with Idealliance**

Idealliance is a valued partner and the collaboration between us in the Idealliance China project initiated since 2007 has been deemed successful and acknowledged by our both organizations. It came to my surprise to read the attached email from your CEO, Tim Baechle, alleging Brenda Pang, Executive Director of APTEC/Idealliance China failed to act in accordance with the MOU between us on Idealliance China, and notifying the establishment of Idealliance Taiwan. We treasure a lot our partnership and take this allegation seriously. In order for us to initiate our investigation and subsequent remedial course of action, we would like to request the following information from Idealliance to help us investigate what is jeopardizing our partnership:

1. How did Brenda fail to act in accordance with the MOU?
2. What are the actions unbecoming of an Idealliance partner?
3. Was the establishment of Idealliance Taiwan discussed in the Idealliance Board meeting?
4. What is the plan for Idealliance with the existing MOU of Idealliance China which covers Taiwan?

We together have achieved a lot in this 10-year partnership and it is our desire to further the collaboration. Look forward to hearing from you.

Yours sincerely,

Ho Kar Hun

Chairman

APTEC Board of Directors

---

#### **2018 年 9 月 20 日- APTEC 收到 Idealliance 通知即時終止合約**

- APTEC 何家鏗主席尚未收到 Idealliance 主席之回覆，APTEC 卻已經收到 Idealliance 一個簡單的終止合約電郵通知
- 沒有提及交接等問題

----- Original Message -----

**From:** "Timothy Baechle" <tbaechle@idealliance.org>

**To:** "brendaok@aptec.hkprinters.org" <brendaok@aptec.hkprinters.org>

**Sent:** Thu, 20 Sep 2018 05:34:10 +0000

**Subject:** Termination of MOU and Relationship with Idealliance China/APTEC

Dear Brenda—

We have formally decided to terminate our relationship with APTEC, therefore terminating the MOU for what was Idealliance China, which also eliminates your position on our Board of Directors. When I return from my travels, I will send you a formal letter of termination, but this termination of our relationship is effective immediately, today, September 20, 2018.

Regards,

Timothy Baechle  
CEO

**2018 年 9 月 20 日 - APTEC 總監收到 Idealliance 主席回覆予所有董事**

- 同日稍後，Brenda 收到 Idealliance 董事局主席回覆所有委員（由於當時 Brenda 是 Idealliance 董事局成員之一，因此收到此電郵）
- 主席 Wayne 表明不是董事局處理，因此不會回覆何家鏗先生

**From:** "wayne@flatoutbranding.com" <wayne@flatoutbranding.com>

**To:** tlucien@aarp.org, dpagliarello@kmb.konicaminolta.us, jsola@zinio.com, dick.ryan@lsc.com, tbaechle@idealliance.org, dsteinhardt@idealliance.org, michael.grady@sgsco.com, ejansen@csa.canon.com, todd@cbx.com, brendaok@aptec.hkprinters.org, steven@harwillexpresspress.com, frank.tueckmantel@efi.com

**Sent:** Thu, 20 Sep 2018 08:57:49 -0500 (CDT)

**Subject:** RE: Partnership between Idealliance and APTEC / Idealliance China

All,

In regards to this email that all received yesterday, I wanted to respond and share as to our next step.

Upon review and after discussion with Tim Baechle, this is more politically motivated than business. As many are aware of China and Taiwan have been in dispute as to the independence of Taiwan for a number of years. This is part of the root of the issue as to our business relationship with China and Taiwan.

The most important element of all of this is that this is not a board issue or a topic that we as a

board would be required to engage in. We have always allowed our leadership team to conduct and manage our business relationships with all of our affiliates and vendors. Chairman Hun from APTEC reaching out to us directly does not change this. Tim and staff have a great grasp of the situation and are dealing with this appropriately. For this reason Tim and I have decided that as Chair I will not respond to Chairman Hun.

If you have any further questions on any of this please do not hesitate in reaching out to Tim or myself.

Thanks,

Wayne

---

**2018 年 10 月 7 日- APTEC 主席再次發電郵至 Idealliance 主席跟進事件**

- 由於 APTEC 主席沒有收到 Idealliance 主席之前的回覆，因此再發出電郵跟進，並要求澄清事件以及有權追討賠償。

**From:** [chairman@aptec.hkprinters.org](mailto:chairman@aptec.hkprinters.org) <[chairman@aptec.hkprinters.org](mailto:chairman@aptec.hkprinters.org)>

**Sent:** Sunday, October 07, 2018 11:06 PM

**To:** [Wayne@FlatOutBranding.com](mailto:Wayne@FlatOutBranding.com)

**Cc:** [tlucien@aarp.org](mailto:tlucien@aarp.org); [dpagliarello@kmb.konicaminolta.us](mailto:dpagliarello@kmb.konicaminolta.us); [JSola@zinio.com](mailto:JSola@zinio.com); [dick.ryan@lsc.com](mailto:dick.ryan@lsc.com); Timothy Baechle <[tbaechle@idealliance.org](mailto:tbaechle@idealliance.org)>; David Steinhardt <[dsteinhardt@idealliance.org](mailto:dsteinhardt@idealliance.org)>; [Michael.Grady@sgsco.com](mailto:Michael.Grady@sgsco.com); [ejansen@csa.canon.com](mailto:ejansen@csa.canon.com); [todd@cbx.com](mailto:todd@cbx.com); [brendaok@aptec.hkprinters.org](mailto:brendaok@aptec.hkprinters.org); [steven@harwillexpresspress.com](mailto:steven@harwillexpresspress.com); [Frank.Tueckmantel@efi.com](mailto:Frank.Tueckmantel@efi.com)

**Subject:** Re: Partnership between Idealliance and APTEC / Idealliance China

Mr. Wayne Marshall

International Digital Enterprise Affiliate Inc. ("Idealliance")

1800, Diagonal Road,

Suite 320, Alexandria,

VA 22314-2862

USA

Date: 8<sup>th</sup> October, 2018

Dear Mr. Marshall,



Re: Breach of Idealliance Agreement

Subsequent to my last communication with you seeking clarification and information from Idealliance on partnership issues raised, I am very surprised to receive a letter of termination effective 20<sup>th</sup> September, from Mr. Baechle to this effect.

As you are fully aware, we have been appointed as the sole agent/representative and/or the International Alliance Partner in Greater China (i.e. Mainland China, Hong Kong, Taiwan and Macau) since the year 2007 and that our Ms. Brenda Pang has also been appointed as Idealliance Director since 5<sup>th</sup> May 2017 for a fixed term of 2 years.

However, to our great surprise, you have, without our consent or approval, formed a new alliance in Taiwan, wrongfully and in serious breach of the above Agreement. On our discovery of the same, you have made excuses which are not acceptable to us and you then terminated the above Agreement and the directorship by giving us notice on 22<sup>nd</sup> September 2018, without any reasonable cause.

We must now write to express our deepest discontent with your decision to terminate the above Agreement and the defamatory statement made by your Director of Global Certification Programs on 27<sup>th</sup> September 2018, since it would seriously affect our goodwill and reputation in the printing field, particularly when we are the premier and representative organization under the Hong Kong Printers Association for the promotion of printing standards and standardized practices in Greater China. To avoid unpleasant and costly legal proceedings, we must now also ask you to let us have your proposal for rectification of the matter or for compensation of our damages, within the next 10 days from the date hereof.

Meanwhile, we hereby reserve all our rights on the matter.

Yours sincerely,

Ho Kar Hun  
Chairman  
APTEC Board of Directors

---

**2018 年 10 月 8 日至 10 月 15 日 - Idealliance CEO Tim 及 APTEC 主席多次對話**

- APTEC 主席沒有收到回覆，取而代之是由 Idealliance CEO Tim 回覆。
- 多個郵件內 Tim 沒有提及違反 Idealliance 與 APTEC 之合約，反而多次提及 Brenda 個人行為，以及轉為 APTEC 違規（之前沒有提及過）。
- 而當中 APTEC 主席多次要求證據，Tim 卻沒有提供，只是提供兩位人士以及兩個供應商，經 APTEC 董事向他們求證，沒有發現 APTEC 違規之事。
- 大部份篇幅均著重針對 Brenda 個人。

**From:** "Timothy Baechle" <[tbaechle@idealliance.org](mailto:tbaechle@idealliance.org)>

**To:** "[chairman@aptec.hkprinters.org](mailto:chairman@aptec.hkprinters.org)" <[chairman@aptec.hkprinters.org](mailto:chairman@aptec.hkprinters.org)>

**Cc:**

**Sent:** Mon, 8 Oct 2018 14:36:54 +0000

**Subject:** RE: Partnership between Idealliance and APTEC / Idealliance China

Mr. Ho—

Please see attached letter.

Regards,

**Timothy Baechle**

CEO

Idealliance

Mr. Ho Kar Hun

Chairman

APTEC Board of Directors

Room 112, 1/F, Hong Kong Institute of Vocational Education (Morrison Hill)

6 Oi Kwan Road, Wan Chai, Hong Kong

8 October 2018

Re: Termination of Memorandum of Understanding for Breach

Dear Mr. Ho,

Our decision to terminate the relationship with APTEC and the Memorandum of Understanding for cause was for extensive breach of the Memorandum of Understanding on the part of APTEC, in particular, the actions of Brenda Pang. A short outline for our reasons is noted in this letter. Please note, due to the extensive number of circumstances surrounding the breaches of the Memorandum of Understanding on the part of Brenda Pang, this list does not include all points,

but certainly outlines the key points and seriousness of breach and violations by Brenda Pang, which over a period of months of collecting information, which is corroborated and substantiated information, was the determination for our decision. Brenda Pang's actions are the sole reason behind the action we took as an organization.

Let it be noted, over a period of many months, many matters were discussed with Brenda Pang via Skype calls regarding the substantiated and corroborated information and concerns we were receiving from Greater China. Due to the length of our relationship, Idealliance relentlessly tried to keep this relationship on stable ground, working tirelessly to restore the relationship, however, no corrective action was taken by Brenda Pang and more irreparable damage to the Idealliance brand and programs was being furthered in Greater China due to the actions of Brenda Pang. Over a period of many months, countless emails and Skype calls were exchanged with Brenda Pang regarding numerous things that came to our attention of incredible concern, all of which were deflected, denied, and went uncorrected by Brenda Pang.

We would like to directly address two matters noted in your letter dated, today, October 8, 2018. Brenda Pang not only breached the Memorandum of Understanding countless numbers of times, but she also breached the Idealliance Anti-Trust Policy, Idealliance Intellectual Property Policy and the Idealliance Trademarks Usage and Misuse Policy. We hold your statement regarding our Director of Global Certification Programs in great contempt. No defamatory statements have ever been made about APTEC or any member of your staff. However, Idealliance takes great concern in the letter that was sent out by Brenda Pang on September 26, 2018 to not only everyone in Greater China, but companies, organizations and individuals in regions that were not covered under the Memorandum of Understanding. This action was defamatory, misrepresentative and one that was taken to both further damage the Idealliance brand, but also to be political in action, which is of great concern because Idealliance is not a political organization, nor are we affiliated with any government organization. We ask you, as Chairman of APTEC, to have Brenda Pang immediately cease and desist her continued defamatory statements about and against Idealliance.

#### Brief Outline of Decision to Terminate Memorandum of Understanding

- 1) We found out that APTEC was allowing "failed" submissions to "pass" G7 Master Facility Qualification, which is a violation of Idealliance Policies and Practices and violation of Trademark Usage and Misuse.
- 2) We found out that APTEC was allowing past submissions for renewal which is a violation of Idealliance Policies and Practices and violation of Trademark Usage and Misuse and allowing other non-submitting facilities to submit on behalf of the submitting G7 Master facilities, which is an entirely different level of breach.
- 3) APTEC/Brenda Pang went against the MOU agreement and extended contracts on behalf of

Idealliance, without our authorization, to represent training and certain areas/regions of coverage, offer contracts for representation in territories, which is completely against our policy and 100% in violation of our agreement. Violation of Idealliance Anti-Trust Policy, Idealliance Intellectual Property Policy and the Idealliance Trademarks Usage and Misuse Policy

- 4) We also learned that APTEC was conducting training of our intellectual property without payment to Idealliance, which is in gross violation of the agreement and in violation of the Idealliance Intellectual Property Policy.
- 5) APTEC was notified in writing by Idealliance for “action unbecoming of a partner” on numerous occasions due to Brenda Pang making defamatory statements about individuals, OEMs and organizations, including her behavior, tone and communication regarding matters we brought to her attention directly from Idealliance and her response to such matters. These are all a Violation of the Idealliance Anti-Trust Policy.
- 6) Brenda Pang was urged, encouraged and requested to cover the region that fell under the MOU, in particular, Taiwan. Brenda Pang was even requested to speak at TIGAX 2018, but declined, furthering her failure to cover this area. TIGAX in response requested Idealliance HQ to send someone to speak on Idealliance’ behalf. Once Brenda knew that we had accepted the request, she then requested through TIGAX to speak, which TIGAX declined her request, due to her failure to accept their invitation and previous invitations, as we were told they were greatly offended by her actions.
- 7) After meeting with numerous global OEMs in China in various visits over the last two to three months in the region, we learned that the reason they did not do business with Idealliance China was because of Brenda Pang and they refused to work with her due to her reputation. We also learned that key employees that recently resigned from APTEC did so due to Brenda Pang’s behavior, management style, and her divisive behavior.
- 8) We also learned through direct contacts we have with brands, some of the largest brands in the world, in China, that they refused to work with APTEC due to reputations issues of Brenda Pang/APTEC.
- 9) Upon termination of the agreement, APTEC sent out a mass letter to the Greater China region and well outside the region covered under the MOU, inferring that Idealliance pulled out of China due to Sino-Pac and the U.S. Governments recognition of Taiwan. This is not only inflammatory but could not be further from the truth and this is maligning and defamatory of Idealliance, as we are not a political organization, we are not affiliated or funded by any government, nor take any political stance on any political matter anywhere in the world.

Regards,  
Timothy J. Baechle  
Chief Executive Officer

---

**From:** [chairman@aptec.hkprinters.org](mailto:chairman@aptec.hkprinters.org) <[chairman@aptec.hkprinters.org](mailto:chairman@aptec.hkprinters.org)>  
**Sent:** Tuesday, October 09, 2018 2:15 AM  
**To:** Timothy Baechle <[tbaechle@idealliance.org](mailto:tbaechle@idealliance.org)>  
**Subject:** RE: Partnership between Idealliance and APTEC / Idealliance China

Dear Tim,

Your reply is well received. APTEC takes this very seriously and would like to conduct in depth investigation. Grateful if you would **provide us more details and evidences.** Thanks.

Yours sincerely,  
Ho Kar Hun  
Chairman  
APTEC Board of Directors

----- Original Message -----

**From:** "Timothy Baechle" <[tbaechle@idealliance.org](mailto:tbaechle@idealliance.org)>  
**To:** "[chairman@aptec.hkprinters.org](mailto:chairman@aptec.hkprinters.org)" <[chairman@aptec.hkprinters.org](mailto:chairman@aptec.hkprinters.org)>  
**Sent:** Tue, 9 Oct 2018 14:40:45 +0000  
**Subject:** RE: Partnership between Idealliance and APTEC / Idealliance China

Dear Mr. Ho—

Thank you for your response. We can assure you that after a 10-year relationship with APTEC, this was not a decision that was made hastily, but one that was made over a long and extended period of time after extensive meetings and communications with many individuals. It certainly was a very, very difficult decision, however, as we explained in our letter, **there is only one individual that everything tied back to within APTEC and that was Brenda Pang and no matter how hard we tried to hold on to this relationship, no corrective action was taken and no accountability was taken on her part.**

We certainly and most probably do not have to tell you this, but the individuals, OEMs, service providers and brands that came forward to share information with us, which prior to them having the tremendous courage to come forward on their own, they were reluctant in bringing any of this

to our attention because they were met with character defamation and derogatory comments when they brought details that were completely unknown to Idealliance USA to your Executive Director. We think in a lot of ways, that this negative blow-back they received for speaking out gave them courage to approach us directly in-person when we were traveling overseas, including others that flew to America to meet with us in person to discuss the gravity of concern and matters at hand. You can imagine our surprise that we were met with by the overwhelming flow of corroborated and substantiated matters that we were entirely unaware of, including information that continues to come in, unsolicited daily.

The facts, details, and decision to ultimately end our relationship solely came down to the actions of one individual and that is Brenda Pang. We believe and encourage you to look at relationships that used to exist for years that are now completely shattered because of Ms. Pang's actions and behavior, not only in Hong Kong, but also in other parts of China. If you truly look at historical relationships that used to exist, you will find they no longer exist. If you look to former APTEC employees who recently left, who many in the industry, including all of us at Idealliance held in very high regard, you will find that they left for one reason only and it was not for a better job. Why people had the courage to finally speak up is unknown to us, but it was almost like a wave when it came to us, all unsought by Idealliance. Brenda Pang's actions that went against every policy of Idealliance and her character that she displayed greatly hurt many people, both individually and as businesses, including Idealliance. The facts we brought to you, again all overwhelmingly corroborated and substantiated, left Idealliance with a very difficult business decision to make. We will tell you that there are many wonderful people at APTEC that we hold in very high regard, however the decisions and behavior of your Executive Director not only led to the dissolution of the Memorandum of Understanding, but still effect those still employed by APTEC, but are scared to speak up.

Best,

**Timothy Baechle**

CEO

Idealliance

**From:** [chairman@aptec.hkprinters.org](mailto:chairman@aptec.hkprinters.org) <[chairman@aptec.hkprinters.org](mailto:chairman@aptec.hkprinters.org)>

**Sent:** Thursday, October 11, 2018 4:43 AM

**To:** Timothy Baechle <[tbaechle@idealliance.org](mailto:tbaechle@idealliance.org)>

**Subject:** RE: Partnership between Idealliance and APTEC / Idealliance China

Dear Tim,

Thank you for your information. We do not tolerate any acts of misconduct. Concrete evidences

are much needed to substantiate the acts described. Please let us have the facts and details of incidents or invite your sources to contact me directly so that quick actions would be taken.

Yours sincerely,  
Ho Kar Hun  
Chairman  
APTEC Board of Directors

**From:** "Timothy Baechle" <[tbaechle@idealliance.org](mailto:tbaechle@idealliance.org)>  
**To:** "[chairman@aptec.hkprinters.org](mailto:chairman@aptec.hkprinters.org)" <[chairman@aptec.hkprinters.org](mailto:chairman@aptec.hkprinters.org)>  
**Sent:** Thu, 11 Oct 2018 15:24:57 +0000  
**Subject:** RE: Partnership between Idealliance and APTEC / Idealliance China

Dear Mr. Ho—

Thank you for your email. As I outlined in previous correspondence, the amount of information, facts, evidence and misconduct was overwhelming. It was literally too much to even comprehend at first, which is why it took us by such surprise, and it was isolated solely to conduct, actions and behavior of Ms. Brenda Pang. As I stated, we have much respect for you, HKPA, the APTEC staff, including the APTEC staff that has recently left, and for many years we have valued our relationship. However, Ms. Pang, when confronted with the grave concerns and complaints from individuals and organizations they were met with complete disregard, then their character was defamed and Ms. Pang explained that "APTEC does not follow Idealliance USA and she does things her way". They were also told by Ms. Pang that their complaints will go nowhere because "she is like a daughter to Mr. Ho and the Hong Kong Printers Association is very powerful". In fact, someone actually called me this morning from Hong Kong and literally repeated these very statements almost verbatim.

The Mr. Ho I know, which is you, is certainly someone I have always found to be an individual of impeccable character, warm, professional and kind. Most everyone, including Idealliance, strongly believed none of these concerns ever made their way to you and the HKPA Board of Directors, and perhaps the Board of Directors of HKPA and yourself were not being given the facts or provided with the entire outline of events of situations from Ms. Pang. As you well know yourself, it is very unusual for individuals in Chinese culture to speak out, but people were effected so egregiously they finally had the courage to do so because it was effecting their business and their reputations. I will work with my staff to encourage people to come forward to you directly, in the hopes that they do, without fear of any repercussion, which they all have because of what they were met with when they did bring up complaints and concerns with Ms. Pang and coming to you as the Chairman of a very prominent and powerful association is even a bigger step. They came to us because they know of our value system and how communicative we are around the world and the fact that we always take every concern seriously and treat everyone, no matter who they are or

the size of their organization with the very same respect.

In closing, as I stated, I will work with our staff and those in the region to encourage them to come forward to you, but I can also provide you a couple of names of people that have been extremely professional and open with us with their concerns and despite how they were effected both personally and as a business never spoke negatively about APTEC or the Hong Kong Printers Association. They simply outlined what had occurred, how it effected them, what they initially did to try to resolve the issue, and how it has impacted them both personally and professionally. We have listened with delicate ears to everyone. I do not think our relationship is beyond restoring, but I do think, it would not be possible with the current Executive Director.

[REDACTED]

Best,

**Timothy Baechle**

CEO

Idealliance

**From:** [chairman@aptec.hkprinters.org](mailto:chairman@aptec.hkprinters.org) <[chairman@aptec.hkprinters.org](mailto:chairman@aptec.hkprinters.org)>

**Sent:** Monday, October 15, 2018 7:27 PM

**To:** Timothy Baechle <[tbaechle@idealliance.org](mailto:tbaechle@idealliance.org)>

**Subject:** RE: Partnership between Idealliance and APTEC / Idealliance China

Dear Tim,

We will investigate and contact the named people. You are welcomed to provide more evidences.

Thanks.

Yours sincerely,

Ho Kar Hun

Chairman

APTEC Board of Directors



**From:** "Timothy Baechle" <[tbaechle@idealliance.org](mailto:tbaechle@idealliance.org)>

**To:** "[chairman@aptec.hkprinters.org](mailto:chairman@aptec.hkprinters.org)" <[chairman@aptec.hkprinters.org](mailto:chairman@aptec.hkprinters.org)>

**Sent:** Tue, 16 Oct 2018 04:51:09 +0000

**Subject:** RE: Partnership between Idealliance and APTEC / Idealliance China

Dear Mr. Ho—

I have passed your message to my staff should other people approach us.

Best,

**Timothy Baechle**

CEO

Idealliance

---

**2018 年 11 月 29 日 - APTEC 主席再發電郵給 Tim**

- APTEC 向 Tim 再發電郵，說明並沒有發現 APTEC 違規之證據，以及眾委員全力支持 Brenda 及肯定其工作和貢獻，並要求 Tim 撤回其指控及向 Brenda 道歉。

**From:** [chairman@aptec.hkprinters.org](mailto:chairman@aptec.hkprinters.org)

**To:** "Timothy Baechle" <[tbaechle@idealliance.org](mailto:tbaechle@idealliance.org)>

**Sent:** Thu, 29 Nov 2018 14:50:18 +0800

**Subject:** RE: Partnership between Idealliance and APTEC / Idealliance China

Dear Tim,

Ever since you brought up the issue on Ms. Brenda Pang, APTEC has taken the matter very seriously. A special group with members from our management committee has been formed to investigate the case.

However, we find that there are no actual facts proving Ms. Pang has misconducted in the way as you pointed out. Furthermore, despite our repeated requests, we have not received any concrete evidence from you to substantiate your serious allegations and/or libelous statements against Ms. Pang.

If no concrete evidence is forthcoming, please withdraw your allegations and offer an apology to Ms. Pang, in order that the whole issue will be settled pleasantly.

The contributions made by Ms. Pang in promoting the printing standardization in the Greater China region and towards APTEC are highly recognized. I and our Board Members fully entrust her to continue leading APTEC in serving the industry.

Regards,

Ho Kar Hun

Chairman

APTEC Board of Directors